



ria y Zootecnia https://veterinariamexico.fmvz.unam.mx/

Scoping review of primary studies evaluating Bovine *in vitro* oocyte maturation and embryo development

Abstract

We conducted a scoping review to 1) map and categorize published studies reporting interventions during the in vitro production of Bovine embryos and 2) qualitatively summarize the effects of treatments based on hormones, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids during oocyte maturation and embryo development. We searched electronic databases using keywords ('Bovine', 'embryo', 'blastocyst', 'oocyte', 'in vitro', 'quality') derived from the PIOS approach of the PRISMA statement. We identified 231 studies published during 2000-2021, with 133 being published between 2012 and 2021. The 231 studies were classified into four treatment categories: culture conditions (28), medium composition (45), bioactive supplements (79), and other additives (79), with 19 subcategories within these categories. A total of 77 studies included hormones, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids, among which 53 studies reported a positive effect on embryo production. Hormone-based treatments using melatonin, gonadotropins, and steroids were the most effective, followed by interventions assessing growth factors such as EGF, FGF, IGF-1, and BMP. These treatments improved oocyte competence, cytoplasmic/nuclear maturation, oocyte quality, and blastocyst development. Although free-serum media and synthetic/alternative products can partially or totally replace serum, it is sometimes necessary even at low concentrations. At high concentrations, hormones or growth factors may have detrimental effects on oocyte nuclear maturation, impair embryo development, and decrease embryo survival. Further meta-analyses are needed to estimate the intervention-specific effects. Future research should focus on interventions that have a positive effect and can be used extensively for Bovine production.

Keywords: Embryo quality; Embryo culture; Hormones; Growth factors; Oocyte quality; Oocyte maturation.

Cite this as:

Lizarraga C, Gaxiola SM, Castro del Campo N, Enriquez-Verduzco I, Rodriguez-Gaxiola MA, Montero-Pardo A, Hernandez-Carreño PE, Ramirez-Valdez A, Diaz D. Scoping review of primary studies evaluating Bovine *in vitro* oocyte maturation and embryo development. Veterinaria Mexico OA. 2024;11. doi: 10.22201/fmvz.24486760e.2024.1315.

Carlos Lizarraga¹ Soila M. Gaxiola^{1,*} 0000-0002-5078-7636 Nohemi Castro del Campo¹ 0000-0001-5248-3719 Idalia Enriquez-Verduzco¹ 0000-0001-6205-6083 Miguel A. Rodriguez-Gaxiola¹ D000-0002-6488-797X Arnulfo Montero-Pardo¹ 0000-0002-8836-4591 Pavel E. Hernandez-Carreño² 0000-0001-8525-7646 Armando Valdez-Ramirez³ 0009-0009-6254-4103 Daniel Diaz^{4,*} 0000-0003-2302-1982

¹ Universidad Autónoma de Sinaloa, Facultad de Medicina Veterinaria y Zootecnia, Sinaloa, México

² Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Facultad de Medicina Veterinaria y Zootecnia, Ciudad de México, México

> ³ Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad Xochimilco, Ciudad de México, México

⁴ Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Facultad de Ciencias, Ciudad de México, México.

> *Corresponding authors Email address: soilagaxiola@uas.edu.mx ddiaz@ciencias.unam.mx

Submitted: 2024-02-08 Accepted: 2024-05-08 Published: 2024-06-13 Additional information and declarations can be found on page 24 © Copyright 2024

Carlos Lizarraga *et al.*







Study contribution

This scoping review aims to map the evidence on treatments used during Bovine *in vitro* embryo production. The majority of related publications have focused on the oocyte maturation process, where hormones, growth factors, and FBS administered at the proper concentrations improved such process. Likewise, hormones, gonadotropins, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids applied at the right measured during embryo culture improved the yield and quality of embryos produced *in vitro*. The information presented here can be used to classify the knowledge on the topic and direct future research.

Introduction

In cattle, assisted reproductive techniques rely heavily on embryo production. *In vivo* embryo production has been a well-established technique for several decades, allowing for up to 80 % of commercialized embryos to be obtained worldwide.⁽¹⁾ However, in recent years, *in vitro* embryo production has become an alternative system for producing Bovine embryos from immature oocytes due to its advantages and flexibility.⁽²⁾ Although *in vivo* embryo production is considered the gold standard due to the higher quality and yield of embryos produced, in recent years, the number of *in vivo*-produced embryos has stabilized worldwide. Meanwhile, the transfer of *in vitro*-produced embryos has continued to increase at a rate of 12 % per year. According to the International Embryo Transfer Society, in 2016, the number of *transferable in vitro*-produced embryos surpassed the number of *in vivo*-produced embryos surpassed the number of *in vivo*-produced embryos may be combined with the tendency toward more efficient *in vitro* procedures.⁽³⁾

In vitro production of embryos is replacing traditional multiple ovulation embryo transfer.⁽⁴⁾ However, one of the main challenges of *in vitro* techniques is the reduced rate of embryo development to the blastocyst stage.⁽⁵⁾ Embryos produced through *in vitro* culture systems often have lower quality than those produced through *in vivo* culture systems, resulting in lower pregnancy rates for *in vitro*-produced blastocysts compared to *in vivo*-produced blastocysts.⁽⁶⁾ The primary objective for veterinarians and embryologists is to identify and select Bovine embryos with the highest developmental potential for transfer.⁽⁷⁾

To achieve this, the International Embryo Transfer Society recommends assessing embryo quality using metrics such as blastomere symmetry, fragmentation, thickness of the zona pellucida, and the rate of cleavage.⁽⁸⁾ Embryo quality is classified using a numerical code based on the morphological integrity of the embryo: Code 1 represents excellent or good quality, with symmetrical embryos having a spherical mass with uniform blastomeres; Code 2 represents fair quality, with embryos having moderate irregularities in shape; Code 3 represents poor quality, with embryos having major irregularities; and Code 4 represents dead or degenerating embryos.⁽⁹⁾

The production of embryos involves crucial steps such as oocyte maturation (meiotic, cytoplasmic, and molecular), fertilization, and embryo development, which significantly affect embryo survival.⁽¹⁰⁾ Therefore, the culture system used during the oocyte maturation and embryo culture stages has a significant impact on the

development and quality of the blastocysts produced.⁽¹¹⁾ Despite the importance of culture conditions during the different stages of embryo production, there is still no consensus on the optimal medium for Bovine oocyte maturation or the optimal culture conditions and characteristics after fertilization for embryo development.⁽¹²⁾

The quality of the oocyte is influenced by the ovarian follicle, which in turn determines the quality of the embryo during *in vitro* production. Therefore, to comprehend and assess the various factors that influence the developmental potential of *in vitro*-produced Bovine embryos, it is essential to have a detailed understanding of the three main processes that significantly impact oocyte quality: oocyte developmental competence (including meiosis resumption, cleavage after fertilization, blastocyst development, pregnancy to term, and production of healthy offspring), oocyte maturation, and follicular differentiation.⁽¹³⁾ However, *in vitro* conditions for oocyte development have not yet been improved to produce consistent blastocyst rates above 40 %. Therefore, one of the main challenges in oocyte maturation is to mimic the ovarian follicle environment to increase the success of Bovine blastocysts production.⁽¹¹⁾

Similarly, *in vitro* culture conditions for embryo development are inferior compared to those *in vivo*. In consequence, both developmental competence and embryo quality are often compromised.⁽¹²⁾ As a result, there has been a substantial increase in primary research over the last two decades focused on obtaining additional knowledge regarding culture conditions during oocyte maturation and embryo development. An extensive and diverse body of scientific literature has been produced, making it challenging to acquire current knowledge to aid evidence-based decision making. Therefore, we conducted a scoping review to systematically map and summarize published primary studies that investigate the impact of treatments on the embryo production process, specifically during oocyte maturation and embryo development.

The purpose of this research was to conduct a scoping review to answer two questions related to Bovine *in vitro* embryo production: 1) What is the body of evidence on the characteristics and types of treatments used during Bovine *in vitro* embryo production?, and 2) What are the effects of hormones, growth factors, serum, and reproductive fluids on *in vitro* oocyte maturation and embryo culture in bovines? To answer the first question, we did not provide a summary of the publication's results. Instead, we mapped the research to classify it into defined categories, which allowed us to understand its nature and extent.⁽¹⁴⁾

To address the second question, we qualitatively described and summarized the findings of the selected sources of evidence to disseminate the main results to technical experts and decision-makers. Scoping reviews are a contemporary and innovative method for synthesizing evidence on various veterinary topics.^(15, 16) They utilize rigorous and explicit methodologies to address research questions that aim to identify key concepts and types of evidence.⁽¹⁷⁾ Scoping reviews employ a systematic approach to identify, select and synthesize the most relevant sources of evidence,⁽¹⁴⁾ which allows summarizing findings from a body of evidence of a heterogeneous nature, both in methods and approaches.⁽¹⁸⁾

The evidence presented in this study may serve as a guide for mapping and categorizing the diversity and extension of scientific research assessing Bovine *in vitro* embryo production and for understanding, in a broad sense, the main effects of some of the treatments used during such process.



Methods

Protocol

The research followed a protocol developed *a priori* in accordance with the PRISMA-P statement (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-analysis Protocol).⁽¹⁹⁾ The protocol is available upon reasonable request to the corresponding author. Additionally, the study was reported in compliance with the PRISMA-ScR extension for scoping reviews.⁽¹⁸⁾

Eligibility criteria

The Population, Intervention, Outcomes, Study (PIOS) approach of the PRISMA-ScR statement was chosen to define the inclusion criteria due to the nature of the research,⁽¹⁸⁾ and Table 1 provides a summary of the definitions of each criterion. To find the most recent literature on Bovine *in vitro* embryo production, we considered primary research published in English, Portuguese, or Spanish from 2000 to 2021. The research focused on factors affecting and regulating culture conditions during oocyte maturation and embryo development. Only primary research available in full text was considered. To ensure a sufficient level of methodological rigor, we excluded gray literature such as theses, association or governmental reports, unpublished studies, or abstracts presented at congresses.⁽²⁰⁾

Information sources and search strategy

A three-step approach was utilized to search for potential studies related to the topic. Firstly, two reviewers defined a broad and varied collection of search terms (thesaurus). Secondly, the reviewers conducted pilot searches using combinations of these terms. From these searches, they chose the final search terms based on their yield of records related to the topic. Finally, a single reviewer conducted comprehensive searches in the following electronic databases using the final search terms: PubMed, Scopus, Virtual Health Library (VHL), Redalyc, ScienceDirect, Web of Science, and CAB abstracts.

Acronym	Definition
(P) Population	This study experimentally evaluated <i>in vitro</i> culture conditions during oocyte maturation and culture of Bovine embryos produced from oocytes obtained <i>in vivo</i> or <i>in vitro</i> . Studies reporting the use of cloned or parthenogenic embryos were excluded.
(I) Intervention	 Studies evaluating at least one of the following categories: A - Culture conditions, including oxygen availability, coculture, and individual or small-group culture. B - Medium composition, including buffers, salts, sera, reproductive fluids, synthetic reproductive fluids, synthetic serum, media substitutes, and carbohydrates. C - Bioactive supplements, including hormones, amino acids, vitamins, and growth factors. D - Other additives, including alkaloids, antioxidants, enzymes, drugs, metals, metalloids, proteins, peptides, organic compounds, and fatty acids.
(O) Outcomes	Studies that reported at least one of the following variables were included: oocyte maturation, cleavage rate, hatching rate, blastocyst rate, embryo quality, and embryo development.
(S) Study	This study includes only primary research published in peer-reviewed journals from 2000 to 2021 and with language restrictions (English, Portuguese, or Spanish).

Table 1. The eligibility criteria according to the PIOS approach of the PRISMA statement



To conduct the final searches, a reviewer utilized a search command that incorporated the following term groups in combination with Boolean operators (AND and OR): 1) Bovine OR cow OR cattle OR calf, 2) embryo OR superovulation OR blastocyst OR oocyte OR cumulus oophorus complex OR *in vitro*, and 3) quality OR quantity OR transferable OR number OR fertility OR fecundation OR conception OR gestation. Additionally, methodological filters were applied to each electronic database, and searches were restricted to titles and abstracts. Table S-1 displays the search commands utilized in each database. The searches were conducted between October 3rd and 10th, 2021. Once the search process was completed, the study records were downloaded and added to an EndNote X9 library (Clarivate, USA).

Selection of the evidence sources

The process of selecting studies for the narrative synthesis involved the following steps: duplicate records from the library were removed both automatically and manually by one reviewer; the same reviewer then applied the inclusion criteria to the titles and abstracts to eliminate any records that were not relevant to the topic; full-text articles of the selected records were retrieved for the eligibility process; finally, a single reviewer performed the final eligibility process using a pilot-tested standardized format based on the inclusion criteria. The main reason for exclusion was defined in each of the excluded studies.

Process for creating data tables and graphs

Two reviewers collaborated to identify the variables to be extracted and created an Excel database to generate the data tables and graphs. The format was evaluated independently by both reviewers, who standardized the extraction format in 5 % of randomly selected articles to ensure that all relevant information was extracted. Once the questionnaire was refined, it was applied to the remaining studies to complete the process. The information from each individual study was extracted by a single reviewer and organized into data tables and graphs. A second reviewer then verified all extracted information, and any discrepancies were discussed and resolved. The process of creating the data tables was iterative.

Extraction of individual data

To achieve the initial objective of the research, which is to map the sources of evidence, we extracted the following information from each of the included articles: a description of the general characteristics of the study, including the author, year of publication, and country where the study was performed; a description of the source of the biological material, including the breed and age of the females, the origin of the specimen, and the method for collecting the biological material; and a description of the type of intervention, including the category of intervention (culture conditions, medium composition, bioactive supplements, or other additives), the treatment regimen (dose, concentration, group, comparison, and so on), the time of treatment (oocyte maturation or embryo development), and the main outcomes evaluated.

To cover the effects of hormones, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids during oocyte maturation and embryo culture, we extracted the following data from each article: 1) the study's objective, including a brief description of its main goal; 2) a methodological description of the study, including a brief overview of the research methods and techniques used; and 3) the main findings, including a qualitative summary of the principal results.

Synthesis of results and visualization of the body of evidence

To map the research, the studies were grouped into four treatment categories: A) culture conditions, B) medium composition, C) bioactive supplements, and D) other additives. A general summary of the body of evidence is presented based on the characteristics of all the studies. Then, each category and its studies are described individually. Additionally, visual aids such as descriptive graphs, maps, and Sankey diagrams were created to accompany the narrative synthesis of the individual studies. To summarize the effects of hormones, growth factors, and sera or reproductive fluids during maturation, summary tables were constructed. Except for the Sankey diagrams (https://sankeymatic.com) and the geographic map (Excel), all the graphs were constructed with Prism 10 (GraphPad, Inc., USA).

Results and discussion

Selection process of the sources of evidence

Figure 1 depicts the process of selecting studies for the narrative synthesis. A total of 5 601 study records were identified by searching electronic databases. The Web of Science contributed the most (83.2 %, 4 662 studies), while PubMed and Redalyc contributed the least (21 and 14, respectively). After automatic and manual removal of duplicates, 4 524 records remained for selection. During the title review, 2 129 unrelated titles were excluded. After reviewing the abstracts, 567 studies were selected for full-text retrieval, of which only 546 were retrieved for the full-text eligibility process. Finally, after applying the eligibility criteria, 315 studies were excluded because they did not meet the inclusion criteria. The reasons for exclusion are summarized in Figure 1. A total of 231 studies (4.1 %) were ultimately identified and included. The complete list of studies included in the review grouped by treatment category and subcategory is presented in Table S-2.

General characteristics of the sources of evidence

Among the 231 studies identified, 133 were accumulated in the last decade between 2012 and 2021. According to Figure 2A, the number of publications per year increased gradually, with the peak in 2017 (21 studies). These results indicate a growing interest in this topic in recent years. Based on the origin of the studies, the continents that contributed the highest number of publications were the Americas, Asia, and Europe with 85, 71, and 71 publications, respectively. Australia contributed the least with only four studies (Figure 2B). Brazil, the United States of America, and Argentina had the highest number of contributions in the American continent with 34, 20, and 14 studies, respectively.





Figure 1. The PRISMA flowchart illustrates the selection and eligibility process of the studies included in the scoping review.

Spain had the highest number of studies in Europe with 24, followed by the United Kingdom with 10 studies, and Belgium with nine studies. In Asia, Japan, South Korea, and China had 22, 19, and 11 studies, respectively (Figure 2C). In 2020, the commercial production of *in vitro* embryos increased by 12 %, resulting in 1.5 million declared embryos. This technique is the preferred method for beef cattle breeding in the main countries of the international meat market, including Argentina, Australia, Brazil, and the USA. This increase in production may be attributed to the economic significance of this industry in these countries.⁽²¹⁾

In total, 89.6 % (207/231) of the studies used biological material from the abattoir. Sixteen studies did not specify the source, and eight publications reported the use of cows *in vivo* as the source of the oocytes (Figure 2D). The use of ovaries, mainly from slaughtered females at the abattoir, indicates that this last source is preferred for experimental studies because it allows for a greater number of experiments to be performed without affecting animals that are productively active. For this reason, using ovaries obtained from slaughtered animals ensures a continuous supply of oocytes while avoiding the use of animals with high genetic value. Additionally, these oocytes are obtained at a low cost, come from animals in different stages of the estrous cycle, and can be matured, fertilized, and cultivated *in vitro* for study or commercial purposes. However, oocytes obtained from a slaughterhouse may come from ovaries of mixed quality due to low reproductive status or illness in cattle.⁽⁸⁾ Scoping review of bovine *in vitro* embryo production

Systematic review & meta-analyses of the system of the sys



Figure 2. A) Number of studies per year of publication, B) percentage of publications according to the continent of origin, C) distribution of publications per country, D) source of the oocytes, E) physiological state, and F) method of collection.

Out of the 231 studies, 65 reported the use of oocytes obtained from adult females, while only 11 out of 231 studies used pubescent/prepubertal animals. The type of female from which the biological material was obtained was not specified in most studies (155/231) (Figure 2E). However, it is possible that these studies used adult females, as culled cows are the most common type of female that enters the abattoir for slaughtering. Out of the reviewed studies, 176 reported using follicular aspiration with needle and syringe as the primary technique for oocyte collection. Meanwhile, 38 studies did not specify the collection method, while follicular dissection (ovary slicing) and ovum pick-up were the least common methods (Figure 2F).

According to the Sankey diagram depicted in Figure 3, 47.2 % (109/231) of the studies assessed oocyte maturation, 38.5 % (89/231) reported results during embryo culture, and 14.3 % (33/231) included both processes. Of the four treatment categories, bioactive supplements were evaluated in 34.2 % of the studies (79/231), medium composition in 19.5 % (45/231), and culture conditions in 12.1 % (28/231). The remaining 34.2 % of the studies (79/231) focused on the effect of other additives on embryo production (Figure 3).

The 231 studies reviewed were classified mutually exclusive and collectively exhaustive into one of 19 subcategories based on the main type of treatment category that the study reported. This allowed for grouping of articles with similar characteristics based on the treatment, though with heterogenous methodology. The general characteristics of the studies in each treatment subcategory are described below. Characteristics and types of treatments used during Bovine *in vitro* embryo production: A review of the evidence







A – Culture conditions: sources of evidence

In this review, we identified 28 studies that evaluated culture conditions for *in vitro* embryo production. These studies were classified into three subcategories (Table S-3).

A1 – Coculture (11 studies). Five studies reported coculturing with oviductal cells as the most common treatment. Two studies evaluated the effect of coculturing with cumulus or luteal cells, and four other studies evaluated the addition of other kind of somatic cells (amniotic membrane cells, mesenchymal stem cells, or Vero cells). These treatments were used both during *in vitro* oocyte maturation and embryo culture. Interestingly, there were contrasting results arising from these treatments, because coculture with amniotic membrane cells enhanced oocyte maturation and developmental competence.⁽²²⁾

Meanwhile, another study showed that the developmental competence of Bovine embryos depended more on the type of the culture media than on the presence or absence of coculture with cumulus cells.⁽²³⁾ Additionally, researchers have investigated coculture with all the above types of somatic cells to create an environment that closely resembles the maternal environment of the embryo. This environment secretes growth and embryotrophic factors.⁽²⁴⁾ Coculture has in this way been found to increase the efficiency of Bovine *in vitro* embryo culture.⁽²⁵⁾

- A2 Oxygen availability (7 studies). Six studies evaluated the effect of oxygen (O₂) availability, and one additional study analyzed the effect of nitric oxide (NO) concentration on embryo production. During *in vitro* embryo production, high concentrations of reactive oxygen species and reactive nitrogen species are often produced, especially at high O₂ tension (20%).⁽²⁶⁾ Research has shown that reducing O₂ tension from 20% to 5% can increase embryo development *in vitro* because high levels of O₂ can be harmful due to the accumulation of reactive oxygen species, which causes oxidative stress and reduces embryo quality.⁽²⁷⁾ Previous studies have reported that inhibiting NO synthesis has a negative effect on oocyte maturation, cleavage, and blastocyst development.⁽²⁸⁾ Furthermore, higher concentrations of NO apparently have a beneficial effect during *in vitro* culture at lower O₂ tensions.⁽²⁶⁾ Although O₂ tension and NO are important during embryo production, there are few studies that assess their effects on embryo production.
- A3 Individual/Small group culture (10 studies). Five studies assessed the effect of individual embryo culture, whereas five other studies analyzed the effect of small group embryo culture. Previous research has demonstrated that culturing embryos in small groups enhanced the rate of development and the quality of the embryos, mainly due to the production of embryokines as a result of paracrine and autocrine stimulation from the neighboring embryos.⁽²⁹⁾ In contrast, individual culture does not stimulate the production of such factors. However, single embryo culture allows tracking and monitoring of individual oocytes and embryos, which may be used to identify biomarkers for assessing embryo quality and development.⁽³⁰⁾

Nevertheless, there exist contrasting evidence on the effect of small group culture. Ahumada et al.⁽³¹⁾ showed that when cultured in large groups, a greater proportion of embryos reached the blastocyst stage, whereas in small groups,



the addition of growth factors could help to partially prevent the deleterious effect of small group culture and increase the percentage of blastocysts. Similarly, Cebrian-Serrano et al.⁽³²⁾ reported that embryos cultured in large groups showed a greater ability to develop than those cultured in smaller groups and that adding some growth factors improved embryo quality when small groups of embryos were cultured. Further research is needed to provide more evidence on this pivotal topic.

B – Medium composition: sources of evidence

We identified a total of 45 studies that reported the effect of medium composition on Bovine embryo production. The studies were classified into six subcategories (Table S-4).

- B1 Sera (12 studies). Nine studies used fetal Bovine serum (FBS), while other three studies used estrus cow serum (ECS) or dairy cow serum. FBS is often included in culture medium to enhance oocyte competence and maturation, leading to the formation of a blastocyst and subsequent offspring generation.⁽³³⁾ However, it has been shown to have negative effects on *in vitro* development (inhibition of first cleavage division), embryo morphology (altered ultrastructure, abnormal blastulation, or impaired compactation), cryotolerance (excessive accumulation of lipid droplets), and fetal and postnatal development in certain conditions (large calf syndrome); therefore, it is important to consider these potential drawbacks when using FBS in culture medium.^(34, 35) Furthermore, FBS may serve as protein supplement to protect embryos from toxic substances, provide growth factors, and reduce the surface tension of the medium, preventing embryos from adhering to the instruments. However, some aspects of its function are not yet fully understood.⁽³⁶⁾
- B2 Reproductive fluids (6 studies). Three studies evaluated the effect of Bovine oviductal fluid, while three studies reported the use of follicular fluid. Reproductive fluids play a crucial role in providing an optimal microenvironment for oocyte growth and development. This is due to their complex composition of growth factors, hormones, electrolytes, proteins, steroids, cytokines, metabolites, and antioxidants, which have been shown to have a positive impact on embryo production.⁽³⁰⁾ For example, oviductal fluid contains carbohydrates, ions, lipids, phospholipids, proteins, and other unknown components that enhance both the quality and quantity of embryos.⁽³⁶⁾
- **B3 Synthetic reproductive fluids** (6 studies). Six studies included synthetic oviductal fluid (SOF) to assess its effect on oocyte maturation and embryo culture. SOF is a commonly used medium for Bovine embryo culture,⁽³⁷⁾ and previous studies have demonstrated that serum-free media based on SOF can be used for Bovine embryo production.^(38, 39) George et al.⁽⁴⁰⁾ reported that the addition of insulin, transferrin, and selenium to SOF medium improved embryonic development rate and quality. Palasz et al.⁽⁴¹⁾ cultured zygotes in SOF with or without BSA and hyaluronic acid (HA) and found that the addition of these substances to the SOF increased the number of blastocyst developed and enhanced the mRNA expression of hyaluronan synthases.
- B4 Synthetic serum/Media substitutes (8 studies). Four studies assessed the effect of serum-free media and other four studies included serum substi-



tutes or media substitutes. Given that serum is produced as a pathological fluid during blood clotting, it has been suggested to cause some detrimental effects on embryo culture.⁽⁴²⁾ Therefore, several studies have reported the use of serum substitutes, though with variable response. Sung et al.⁽⁴³⁾ supplemented zygotes with sodium citrate and two brands of BSA (Sigma[™] vs. ICPbio[™]). The authors found that both sodium citrate and Sigma-BSA increased total blastocyst development.

Another study reported that both BSA-free medium and FBS supplemented with other compounds (growth factors, cytokines, albumin, and hyaluronan) increased the blastocyst rate and improved embryo development and survival.⁽⁴⁴⁾ Del Collado et al.⁽⁴⁵⁾ matured oocytes in different concentrations of fatty acid-free BSA and commercial embryonic fluid to compare them against FBS-supplemented media (10%). The authors concluded that, even at low concentration, FBS is necessary during oocyte maturation. Another study revealed that the percentages of blastocysts and hatched blastocysts in undefined media (FBS or BSA) were significantly greater than those in defined media containing polyvinyl alcohol.⁽⁴⁶⁾

Sagirkaya et al.⁽⁴⁷⁾ reported that the cleavage rate after the addition of 10 % FBS was significantly greater than that after the addition of 10 % synthetic serum substitute. According to the authors, the lack of effect of the serum substitute relies in its differential composition in comparison to FBS, which contains growth factors that may cause a synergistic effect.⁽⁴⁷⁾ Nevertheless, in a further experiment Sagirkaya et al.⁽⁴⁸⁾ showed that the replacement of FBS with a synthetic substitute favors oocyte maturation and embryo development *in vitro*. Therefore, such a contrasting result requires further research to provide more insights on the role of synthetic serum substitute. Even though these types of compounds may offer more constant results due to its known composition, some studies have suggested that serum supplementation, even at low concentration, may still be necessary during embryo production.⁽⁴⁷⁾

- **B5 Carbohydrates** (11 studies). Four studies were conducted to evaluate the effect of glucose or fructose on embryo production, six studies assessed the effect of hyaluronic acid, while another study determined the effect of nutrient depletion. Glucose utilization significantly increases embryonic development in advanced preimplantation stages; however, during earlier preimplantation stages, pyruvate, lactate, and glutamine are preferentially used as energy sources.⁽³⁴⁾ Regarding the effect of hyaluronic acid, some authors have demonstrated that the production of hyaluronic acid is essential for cumulus cell expansion and embryo development,⁽⁴⁹⁾ and reported that adding hyaluronic acid to the medium favored the rate of oocyte maturation in BSA-enriched medium⁽⁵⁰⁾ as well as improved blastocyst hatching and embryo quality.⁽⁵¹⁾ Therefore, since hyaluronic acid has shown to improve the developmental capacity of cultured embryos it is recommended as a supplement for *in vitro* embryo production.⁽⁵²⁾
- B6 Buffers/Salts (2 studies.: One study determined the effect of EDTA during culture, while the other analyzed the effect of various buffer solutions (HEPES, TES, MOPS, and PBS).



C – Bioactive supplements: sources of evidence

The bioactive supplements category included a total of 79 studies, which were classified into four subcategories (Table S-5):

C1 – Hormones (35 studies). Twelve studies reported the effect of metabolic hormones such as ghrelin or insulin, growth hormone (GH), or leptin as their main treatment, followed by eight studies that reported the effect of melatonin. In addition, eight studies utilized steroid hormones, such as estradiol and progesterone, while four studies evaluated the effects of gonadotropins, and three studies included prostaglandins, activin A, and follistatin as the primary treatments on embryo production. To improve maturation conditions, experimental research aims to replicate the *in vivo* environment in which oocyte maturation occurs physiologically. Hormones have been found to be helpful in stimulating maturation.⁽⁵³⁾

A recent review reported that steroid hormones, including progesterone, estradiol, and cortisol, had little effect on embryo development during *in vitro* embryo production. Indeed, some of the studies reviewed showed a negative effect when excessive amounts of hormones were used.⁽⁴⁾ This contrasts with the positive effect exerted by melatonin, which acts as an embryokine during *in vitro* embryo production.⁽⁴⁾ Melatonin has been shown to increase blastocyst cell number, blastocyst production, hatching, and quality.^(54, 55)

- C2 Growth factors (24 studies). Nineteen studies evaluated several growth factors, with epidermal growth factor (EGF, 6 studies), insulin-like growth factor-1 (IGF-1, 6 studies), fibroblast growth factor (FGF, 4 studies), and bone morphogenetic protein (BMP, 3 studies) as the most frequently studied. Additionally, five studies examined a variety of factors, including erythropoietin, IMD/ ADM2₁₋₄₇, embryotrophic factors, leukemia inhibitory factor (LIF), or Interleukin 6 (IL6). FGF is particularly interesting due to its involvement in various cellular processes, such as chemotaxis, cell migration, differentiation, cell survival, apoptosis, embryo development, and angiogenesis. FGF10 has been found in Bovine theca cells, luteal cells, and oocytes in conjunction with the expression of its two main receptors (FGFR1B and FGFR2B), which are regulated by FSH, suggesting that they play an important role in oocyte maturation.⁽⁵⁶⁾ However, there is conflicting evidence regarding the effect of FGF on blastocyst development. Further studies are needed to provide more conclusive evidence concerning the impact of FGF on in vitro embryo production.
- C3 Amino acids (11 studies). Four studies reported the effect of L-carnitine, three more studies included L-arginine, while four other studies reported results with L-cysteine, glycine, L-ergothioneine, or taurine. While there is limited evidence about the impact of amino acids on Bovine embryo production, a previous study has shown that amino acids, such as L-carnitine, can aid in the transportation of fatty acids to the mitochondria for beta-oxidation, enhancement of cumulus cell expansion in bovines, and improvement of mitochondrial activity in embryos by reducing lipid content.⁽⁵⁷⁾
- C4 Vitamins (9 studies). Three studies analyzed the addition of vitamin A metabolites such as retinoic acid or retinol, three studies included vitamin B (B6 or dimethylglycine), two more studies assessed choline or vitamin E analogue, and one study reported the effect of vitamin K on oocyte maturation and embryo production.



D - Other additives: sources of evidence

We identified 79 articles within the category of other additives, which were divided into six subcategories (Table S-6):

- D1 Antioxidants (32 studies). Resveratrol was the most used compound in five studies, followed by cysteamine and glutathione in four and three studies, respectively, and other four studies included astaxanthin, anethole, or pterostilbene. Alpha-tocopherol, lycopene, nobiletin, and native plant extracts were included in two studies each, whereas the other eight studies evaluated a variety of antioxidants. The quality of embryos produced *in vitro* is influenced by the culture environment, in which different types of natural or synthetic antioxidants are added to the culture medium. Recently, it was demonstrated that nobiletin enhances embryo quality by increasing blastocyst formation rates and decreasing the levels of reactive oxygen species and apoptotic cells in embryos.⁽¹²⁾
- D2 Drugs/alkaloids (12 studies). Three studies reported the effect of nicotine or caffeine, three studies assessed urolithin A, butaphosphan, or trichostin A, and one study included lupeol. The other five studies evaluated a wide variety of compounds including flunixin meglumin, dexamethasone, metformin, steroidal glycoalkaloids, or iloprost.
- D3 Fatty acids (13 studies). Four studies evaluated the effect of Omega-3 (alpha-linolenic acid or eicosapentaenoic acid), two studies included Omega 6 (linoleic acid), and two more studies used conjugated linoleic acid. The five additional studies examined lysophosphatidic acid, arachidonic acid, or docosahexaenoic acid, among other compounds.
- D4 Enzymes (6 studies). Two studies reported the use of plasminogen activator, whereas cathepsin B, protein kinase kinase inhibitor (U0126), peroxiredoxin, and phosphodiesterase isoenzyme inhibitor were included in one study, each.
- D5 Metals/Metalloids (10 studies). Ten studies evaluated the effect of zinc, manganese, copper, selenium, and strontium as the main metals or metalloids assessed.
- D6 Proteins/Peptides/Organic compounds (6 studies). Two studies examined the natriuretic C-type peptide, whereas sericin, coagulansin-A, plant protein hydrolysates, and osteopontin were evaluated in one study each.

Effects of hormones, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids used in Bovine in vitro oocyte maturation and embryo culture

Figure 4 summarizes the frequency of negative/no effect or positive effect results on Bovine embryo production reported by 77 studies that used hormones, growth factors, sera, or reproductive fluids during oocyte maturation and embryo culture. Out of the 77 studies, 53 (68.8 %) reported a positive effect of the intervention. Hormone-based interventions accounted for 49.0 % of the positive results (26/53), followed by growth factors at 30.2 % (16/53). Among the 24 studies that reported negative/no effects after an intervention, 33.3 % (8/24) of these reports were obtained using growth factors, followed by 37.5 % (9/24) from treatments that used hormones (Figure 4A). In the following sections, we provide a study-specific



Vol. 11 2024



Figure 4. A) Number of studies that reported positive or negative effects on Bovine embryo production of the four selected subcategories and B-E) donut charts summarizing intervention-specific effects of the four selected subcategories. In donut charts, the percentages shown sum up to 100 %, corresponding to the number of studies that reported a positive effect.

summary of the results for each of the 77 studies, divided according to each of the four treatment categories.

Evidence on the effect of hormones

Based on the data presented in Figure 4B, 26 out of 35 studies (74.3 %) that utilized hormone-based interventions reported a positive effect during oocyte maturation and embryo culture. The main interventions that yielded positive results were melatonin, gonadotropins (FSH/LH), steroids (P_4/E_2), leptin, and GH, which accounted for 80.8 % (21/26) of the positive outcomes reported. Among the nine studies that reported negative or no effects, interventions that used steroids were the most common. Next. We present a summary of 35 studies that evaluated the impact of hormones on the *in vitro* production of Bovine embryos.

Gonadotropins. Ali et al.⁽⁵⁸⁾ cultured oocytes in 0.5 μg/mL r-hFSH for 2 or 6 hours, and the results showed that the treatment enhanced cytoplasmic maturation. Choi et al.⁽⁵⁹⁾ found that the increase in cumulus expansion in proportion to the gonadotropin concentration and the rates of cleavage and blastocyst development were not different between two treatment groups when oocytes were cultured in combinations of 1 or 10 ng/mL FSH and 1 or 10 μg/mL LH . Liu et al.⁽⁶⁰⁾ after culturing oocytes in media supplemented with 0.075, 0.75, 7.5, and 75 IU/mL FSH and LH, reported that low to moderate concentrations (0.75–7.5 IU/mL) of FSH enhanced nuclear maturation and development and

that the highest LH concentrations induced detrimental effects on oocyte nuclear maturation and embryo development. Finally, Salgado et al.⁽⁶¹⁾ found that a greater proportion of LH than FSH in the maturation medium induced a greater maturation rate after culturing oocytes in the following groups (concentrations in μ g/mL): 50 FSH + 150 LH; 100 FSH + 100 LH; and 150 FSH + 50 LH.

Leptin. Kaya et al.⁽⁶²⁾ reported a positive effect on the 8-16-cell stage with 5 µg/mL leptin and 5 µg/mL leptin + 100 µg/mL IGF-1. The authors concluded that the addition of IGF-1 improved the cleavage rate, although the percentage of blastocysts did not differ between groups. In three studies, oocytes were cultured in media supplemented with 1, 10, or 100 ng/mL leptin; Boelhauve et al.⁽⁶³⁾ and Jia et al.⁽⁶⁴⁾ reported that treatment during oocyte maturation improved development to the blastocyst stage and enhanced meiotic maturation and embryo development and quality. In contrast, Arias-Alvarez et al.⁽⁶⁵⁾ found that leptin did not influence day-7 blastocysts and that high concentrations of leptin negatively affected embryo survival.

- **Cortisol**. Da Costa et al.⁽⁶⁶⁾ reported that supplementation with 0.1 µg/mL cortisol during oocyte maturation increased blastocyst formation rates and that cortisol positively affected oocyte competence. In contrast, another study reported that hormones did not affect the rate of embryo development or the number of cells per blastocyst after culturing zygotes in either control, 55 ng/mL P₄, 120 pg/mL E₂, 40 ng/mL cortisol medium, or their combination for 8 days.⁽⁶⁷⁾
- **Triiodothyronine**. One study revealed that medium supplemented with 50 or 100 nM triiodothyronine (T₃) applied during oocyte *in vitro* maturation increased the number of blastocysts after 8 days of culture. The authors concluded that T₃ may positively affects embryo development kinetics.⁽⁶⁸⁾ Another study showed that after culturing oocytes in 50 ng/mL T₃ and thyroxine, the thyroid hormones had a positive effect on blastocyst formation and hatching rates, and it was concluded that embryo quality improved significantly.⁽⁶⁹⁾
- **GH**. Three studies reported the effect of culturing oocytes or morulae on 0, 50, 100, or 200 ng/mL GH. Dong et al.⁽⁷⁰⁾ found that the proportion of metaphase II oocytes was significantly greater at 200 than at 0 *ng*/mL GH, and the authors concluded that the treatment favored oocyte maturation and embryo development. Moreira et al.⁽⁷¹⁾ reported that 100 ng/mL GH increased the cleavage rate and thus enhanced embryo development, while Iwata et al.⁽⁷²⁾ reported that GH at 100 ng/mL improved the rate of development and cell number starting from the morula.
- **Chrelin or insulin**. After culturing oocytes in 0, 200, 800, and 2000 pg/mL ghrelin during *in vitro* maturation of oocytes, Dovolou et al.⁽⁷³⁾ found that ghrelin groups significantly suppressed blastocyst formation rates, whereas Dovolou et al.⁽⁷⁴⁾ found no differences between the control, 200, and 2000 pg/mL ghrelin groups, and fewer blastocysts were produced with 800 pg/mL than in the control group when the hormone was administered daily during the culture of zygotes. Dashtizad et al.⁽⁷⁵⁾ reported that insulin at 10 µg/mL exerted beneficial effects on oocyte and embryo development up to the morula stage.
- E₂ and P₄. Beker et al.⁽⁷⁶⁾ cultured oocytes in control medium or with 1 μg/mL E₂ with or without 0.05 IU/mL recombinant hFSH. The authors found that E₂ alone decreased the percentage of metaphase II oocytes compared to that in the control group and increased the percentage of nuclear aberrations. Additionally,

the authors found that E_2 negatively affected the maturation of oocytes and subsequent embryo development, although this effect was attenuated in the presence of FSH. Larson et al.⁽⁷⁷⁾ after culturing zygotes in 1 or 100 ng/mL P₄ for 1-3 or 4–7 days, reported that the development rate from the morula to the hatched blastocyst stage was similar among the treatments. The authors concluded that supplementation with P₄ during culture does not improve cleavage of presumptive zygotes, embryo development, and blastocyst rate.

Matsuo et al.⁽⁷⁸⁾ used a 3-step oocyte culture system that mimicked temporal physiological changes in E₂ and P₄, and reported that the treatment enhanced *in vitro* embryo development reflected as a greater blastocyst formation rate. Reis et al.⁽⁷⁹⁾ cultured zygotes in the following groups (concentrations in µg/mL): control, 1 E₂ + 100 P₄, 1 E₂, and 100 P₄. The authors reported that E₂ and P₄ together and E₂ alone resulted in greater hatching rates and improved embryo quality.

- **Testosterone**. Silva et al.⁽⁸⁰⁾ reported that 100 nM testosterone and 100 nM dihydrotestosterone increased the rate of oocyte cleavage without affecting embryo development. Finally, Soares et al.⁽⁸¹⁾ cultured oocytes in the following groups: 1) control; 2) 100 nM natriuretic C-type peptide; 3) 500 ng/mL E₂ + 50 ng/mL P₄ + 50 ng/mL androstenedione + 10⁻⁴ IU/mL FSH, and 4) 500 ng/mL E₂ + 50 ng/mL P₄ + 50 ng/mL androstenedione + 10⁻⁴ IU/mL FSH + 100 nM natriuretic C-type peptide. The authors reported that steroids and the peptide did not alter blastocyst formation rates and that steroids interacted with the peptide to delay meiotic resumption and prolong oocyte and cumulus cell communication.
- **Melatonin**. Marques et al.⁽⁸²⁾ cultured zygotes in groups supplemented with 10⁻⁹ M melatonin or 10⁻⁹ M melatonin + blastocoel fluid on day 7 and found that treatment with melatonin and blastocoel fluid increased the hatching rate. Another six studies reported the effect of culturing oocytes in 0, 10-7, 10⁻⁹, and 10⁻¹¹ M melatonin. A concentration between 10⁻⁷ and 10⁻⁹ M melatonin improved the cytoplasmic maturation of Bovine oocytes,⁽⁸³⁾ and enhanced blastocyst yield and quality.^(84, 85)

Marques et al.⁽⁸⁶⁾ found that 10⁻⁹ M melatonin group presented a greater percentage of Grade I blastocysts than did the control group, and Pang et al.⁽⁸⁷⁾ reported that oocyte maturation was enhanced by 10⁻⁹ M melatonin, although this may affect subsequent embryo development. Tian et al.⁽⁸⁸⁾ found that melatonin increased the expression of genes associated with oocyte maturation such as *GDF9*, *MARF1*, and *DNMT1a* and *PTX3* and *HAS1/2* which are genes related to expansion in cumulus cells. Finally, Gutierrez-Añez et al.⁽⁸⁹⁾ found that 0.01 nM melatonin during oocyte maturation enhanced oocyte competence, embryo development, and embryo quality.

Other hormones. Algarra et al.⁽⁹⁰⁾ cultured zygotes in groups treated with 10 or 50 µg/mL recombinant porcine oviductin (pOVGP1) and found that the treatments induced no differences in embryo development. Rodrigues et al.⁽⁵³⁾ showed that 1-10 µM PGE₂ and PGF_{2a} alone or in combination had no effect on embryo development. Another study revealed that, in comparison to 10 ng/mL of follistatin, 10 ng/mL of activin A may enhance the development of Bovine embryos by shortening the duration of the lag-phase which may result in an enhancement of the developmental kinetics at early stages of cleavage.⁽⁹¹⁾



Evidence on the effect of growth factors

According to Figure 4C, 16/24 studies (66.7 %) that used growth factors as the intervention reported a positive effect during Bovine embryo production. Interventions using EGF, FGF, IGF-1, and BMP contributed 81.2 % (13/16) of the positive results reported. Among the eight studies that showed a negative effect on oocyte maturation or no effect on embryo culture, three used IGF-1 as the primary intervention, followed by two studies that included FGF, and two other studies from the "Others" group. Next, we present a study-specific summary of the 24 studies that assessed the effect of growth factors on the *in vitro* production of Bovine embryos.

EGF. Sakagami et al.⁽⁹²⁾ reported that EGF (100 or 200 ng/mL) or IGF-1 (50 or 100 ng/mL) increased the percentage of embryos that developed into blastocysts. Additionally, Sirisathien et al.⁽⁹³⁾ found that 50 ng/mL 5 ng/mL EGF and IGF-1 improved embryo performance and increased embryo yield. Another study revealed that 5 ng/mL EGF improved the proportion of 4-cell stage embryos that reached the blastocyst stage in comparison to 0, 1, or 25 EGF groups, though no differences were documented in the number of 4-cell stage embryos among these four groups.⁽⁹⁴⁾

Mesalam et al.⁽⁹⁵⁾ showed that the number of embryos that cleaved, formed a blastocyst, and hatched was greater in the medium containing insulin-transferrin-sodium selenite + EGF + BSA than in the medium containing FBS. Mtango et al.⁽⁹⁶⁾ found that 10 ng/mL EGF had favorable effects on oocyte maturation and embryo production because it increased the number of metaphase II oocytes and blastocysts. Only one study showed no differences between groups, although the authors concluded that 100 ng/mL EGF is the optimal concentration.⁽⁹⁷⁾

IGF-1. Wang et al.⁽⁹⁸⁾ reported that supplementation with polyphenols at 15 μM, 100 ng/mL IGF-1, and 5.6 mM glucose produced higher cleavage and blastocyst rates than did polyphenols at other concentrations. The authors concluded that these compounds could improve oocyte maturation, embryo development, and blastocyst quality in cattle. Neira et al.⁽⁹⁹⁾ concluded that a combination of cytokines and growth factors that included IGF-1 improved blastocyst yield. Kocygit et al.⁽¹⁰⁰⁾ reported that BSA alone or in combination with IGF-1 + EGF resulted in increased embryo yield and embryo cell mass. Three other studies did not find a significant effect of IGF-1.

Hernandez-Fonseca et al.⁽¹⁰¹⁾ concluded that 5 ng/mL IGF-1 supplementation during *in vitro* culture did not improve the cleavage rate or blastocyst production. Velázquez et al.⁽¹⁰²⁾ showed that 1 000 ng/mL IGF-1 did not enhance blastocyst formation. Indeed, high concentrations of IGF-1 had detrimental effects on Bovine embryos. Finally, Dhali et al.⁽¹⁰³⁾ assessed the single or combined effect of 100 ng/mL IGF-1 and 50 ng/mL stem cell factor and found that the developmental competence of embryos was similar among groups. The authors conclude that serum-free media supplemented with these growth factors, alone or combined, may result satisfactory for producing Bovine embryos.

FGF. Zhang et al.⁽¹⁰⁴⁾ concluded that FGF2 treatment during oocyte maturation enhances blastocyst development, whereas Fields et al.⁽¹⁰⁵⁾ showed that the addition of FGF2 increased the percentage of oocytes that developed into blastocysts. In contrast, two studies did not find a significant effect of FGF.

Diogenes et al.⁽⁵⁶⁾ found that 0.5 ng/mL FGF10 administered during oocyte maturation did not affect cleavage and blastocyst rates. Additionally, the authors reported that the growth factor showed no effect on the developmental kinetics of the embryo. Another study reported that 0.5 ng/mL FGF10 during oocyte prematuration did not improved the quality of the embryo and changed the expression of genes associated with embryo quality.⁽¹⁰⁶⁾

- **BMP**. Machado et al.⁽¹⁰⁷⁾ reported that BMP15 alone or in combination with FGF in maturation medium enhanced cumulus expansion, meiosis progression, and embryo development. Sudiman et al.⁽¹⁰⁸⁾ cultured oocytes in 100 ng/mL pro-mature BMP15, 100 ng/mL mature BMP15, or 100 ng/mL mature GDF9 alone or combined with FSH. The authors assessed the developmental competence of the oocytes and found that pro-mature BMP15 improved blastocyst development, whereas the mature form induced only intermediate levels of blastocyst development that only were higher than those of GDF9 group. In another study, the authors concluded that the preservation of gap junctional communication using 100 ng/mL BMP15 may facilitate the efficient transfer of metabolites from cumulus cells to oocytes, thereby enhancing oocyte developmental commental competence.⁽¹⁰⁹⁾
- **Other factors**. Conde et al.⁽¹¹⁰⁾ reported that the presence of hematopoietic erythropoietin and kit ligand during oocyte maturation had a positive effect on oocyte cytoplasmic maturation and developmental competence without impacting nuclear maturation. Garcia-Hernandez et al.⁽¹¹¹⁾ cultured oocytes in 153 µg/mL IMD/ADM2₁₋₄₇ peptide and reported that the presence of this factor was correlated with the production of healthy metaphase II oocytes. Salgado et al.⁽¹¹²⁾ cultured zygotes in control media or >1, >5, or >10 kDa fractions of embryotrophic factors in conditioned media from BRL cells and found that the fractions increased the number of embryos that reached the 2-8 cell stage. The highest proportion of cleaved embryos was achieved at >10 kDa. However, embryo development to the morula/blastocyst stage was similar among the groups.

Seekford et al.⁽¹¹³⁾ found no significant difference in blastocyst formation after treating embryos with IL6, although this factor may normalize the developmental trajectory of embryos produced *in vitro*. Finally, Vejlsted et al.⁽¹¹⁴⁾ cultured zygotes in 0 or 1 000 U/mL recombinant LIF. Their results showed that in the presence of this factor, less embryos reached the hatched blastocyst stage, and the quality of blastocysts was reduced. The authors concluded that LIF may have adverse effects on embryo development.

Evidence of the effect of sera

According to Figure 4D, 7/12 studies (58.3 %) that used serum-based interventions reported a positive effect during oocyte maturation and embryo culture. Interventions using FBS contributed 6/7 (85.7 %) and ECS 1/7 (14.3 %) of the positive results reported. Among the five studies in which negative/no effects were reported, FBS contributed with three studies, whereas two other studies used ECS. Next, we present a study-specific summary of 12 studies that assessed the effect of sera during the *in vitro* production of Bovine embryos.

ECS or dairy cow serum. Collares et al.⁽¹¹⁵⁾ supplemented cumulus-oocyte complexes with dairy cow serum at the beginning and end of lactation and re-

Systematic review & meta-analyses of the systematic review & meta-analyses doi: 10.22201/fmvz.24486760e.2024.1315

ported no differences between treatments. Mucci et al.⁽³⁴⁾ showed that the hatching rate was lower in embryos cultured in media supplemented with 5% ECS in comparison to serum-free media. Finally, Pereira et al.⁽¹¹⁶⁾ matured cumulus-oocyte complexes in 10 ECS or 0.1% polyvinyl alcohol under two O₂ tension conditions (5% or 20%) for each compound. The authors found that, under 20% O₂ tension, total cell number and blastocyst rate were higher in ECS than in polyvinyl alcohol, though at 5% O₂ tension the results did not differ between treatments. Nevertheless, polyvinyl alcohol + 5% O₂ produced a lower apoptosis index.

FBS. Fernandes-Franca et al.⁽¹¹⁷⁾ concluded that 5% or 10% FBS and 0.8% BSA can be used alone or in combination during *in vitro* maturation. Mesalam et al.⁽¹¹⁸⁾ cultured zygotes in heat-inactivated FBS or FBS devoid of charcoal and dextran. The authors found that developmental competence and embryo mitochondrial activity were both enhanced in media supplemented with FBS devoid of charcoal and dextran. Sudano et al.⁽¹¹⁹⁾ concluded that the use of 2.5% FBS and the addition of phenazine ethosulfate increased embryo survival and quality. Leivas et al.⁽¹²⁰⁾ reported that zygote culture in SOF + BSA + FBS improved the yield of blastocyst and Quality I blastocyst and that the addition of serum increased the efficiency of Bovine embryo production.

Reis et al.⁽¹²¹⁾ cultured zygotes in either one of three groups: SOF + BSA, SOF + FBS, or SOF + FBS + vitamin E. The authors found that supplementing the culture medium with both FBS and vitamin E improved blastocyst yield and quality. Murillo et al.⁽¹²²⁾ cultured oocytes in SOF + BSA with or without 0.1 % FBS and reported that early blastocyst rate was greater for embryos cultured with FBS. Other studies reported a negative effect of FBS. For instance, Restrepo et al.⁽³⁵⁾ found that the presence of 10% FBS during oocyte maturation decreased the mitochondrial activity of the oocytes and reduced the rate of morulae production in comparison to oocytes cultured in serum-free media.

The authors concluded that FBS may have a deleterious effect on the rate of embryo development. Alm et al.⁽¹²³⁾ reported that medium supplemented with 20 % FBS achieved a greater rate of blastocyst development in comparison to medium supplemented with 5% ECS + FSH, HCG, and E₂. Finally, Caínzos et al.⁽¹²⁴⁾ found no significant difference after the culture of oocytes supplemented with FBS, BSA, or polyvinylpyrrolidone.

Evidence on the effect of reproductive fluids

According to Figure 4E, 4/6 studies (66.7%) that used reproductive fluids as the main intervention reported a positive effect during Bovine embryo production. Bovine oviductal fluid and follicular fluid were the two treatments reported by the studies; two studies reported a positive effect of oviductal fluid, whereas two studies reported that follicular fluid improved embryo production. In contrast, negative/no effect results were reported in one study that used oviductal fluid and other that included follicular fluid. Next, we present a study-specific summary of such six studies. **Follicular fluid**. Ali et al.⁽¹²⁵⁾ cultured oocytes for 24 hours in medium supple-

mented with 1, 5, or 10 % follicular fluid, and reported that more oocytes reach the blastocyst stage when cultured with a concentration of 5 %. Momozawa et al.⁽¹²⁶⁾ cultured oocytes in basic maturation medium supplemented with either

Systematic review & meta-analyses of the control of

one of three fractions of follicular fluid or one of three fractions of FBS. The authors reported that the second fraction of follicular fluid and the third fraction of FBS improved the rate of development to the blastocyst stage. In contrast, Cruz et al.⁽¹²⁷⁾ showed that a higher concentration (75-100%) of follicular fluid added to the maturation medium reduced cleavage and blastocyst rates, whereas a lower concentration (50%) of follicular fluid increased the inner cell mass number.

Bovine oviductal fluid. Lopera-Vasquez et al.⁽¹²⁸⁾ cultured zygotes in medium supplemented with oviducal fluid (5%, 10%, or 25%) or FBS (5%) and found that oviductal fluid at low concentrations had a positive effect on the development rate and quality of Bovine embryos. Hamdi et al.⁽³⁶⁾ cultured zygotes with 1.25% oviductal fluid from days 1 to 4 after insemination, followed by 1.25% uterine fluid from days 4 to 9. The authors showed that supplementation with both reproductive fluids favored embryo development. In contrast, Cebrian-Serrano et al.⁽¹²⁹⁾ matured oocytes treated or not with Bovine oviductal fluid and reported no effect on embryo development rate.

Implications of all the available evidence and perspectives for future studies

The scoping review results enabled us to answer our research questions. Firstly, we identified the body of evidence on the characteristics and types of treatments used during Bovine *in vitro* embryo production. We successfully mapped the nature and extent of studies reporting different treatments during the *in vitro* production of Bovine embryos. We identified 231 studies published between 2000 and 2021, with 133 published in the last decade, indicating a growing interest in the topic. The majority of publications came from the Americas, Europe, and Asia.

The studies primarily evaluated ovaries from abattoirs and did not specify the female population used. The 231 studies were categorized into four groups: culture conditions (28 studies), medium composition (45 studies), bioactive supplements (79 studies), and other additives (79 studies). These were further divided into 19 subcategories, with interventions using hormones, antioxidants, and growth factors having the largest number of reports (35, 32, and 24 respectively, Figure 3).

Secondly, the scoping review was conducted to qualitatively summarize the effects of 77 studies that reported the effects of hormones, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids during oocyte maturation and embryo development. Overall, among the 77 studies summarized, positive results were reported in 68.8% of cases (53 studies, Figure 4), among which hormone-based interventions were the most effective, because 26/35 studies that used hormones reported a positive effect. Interventions based on melatonin, gonadotropins, and steroids were the most effective in promoting Bovine embryo production. The second most effective interventions were those that added growth factors to culture medium (16/24 positive effect). In particular, interventions that utilized EGF, FGF, BMP, and IGF-1 were the most effective. The evidence suggests that hormones, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids improves oocyte competence, cytoplasmic and nuclear maturation of Bovine oocytes, oocyte quality, embryonic development, cleavage and blastocyst development rates, and the number of grade I blastocysts. In some cases, it may be possible to substitute serum with artificial or alternative substances during embryo production. While

some studies propose reducing the percentage of serum used in culture to achieve optimal performance, others have concluded that sera or serum proteins, such as BSA, are necessary during oocyte maturation and embryo development, even at low concentrations.

Out of the 77 studies summarized, 24 reported a negative/no effect after the intervention. Sera-based interventions provided the highest number of negative/no effect results (41.6%, 5/12), followed by hormone-based treatments (37.5%, 9/35). Several studies have shown that high concentrations of sera or hormones can have detrimental effects on oocyte nuclear maturation, which impairs embryo development and results in decreased embryo survival, as well as during embryo culture resulting in altered ultrastructure, abnormal blastulation, or impaired compactation. Furthermore, the presence of certain serum molecules can delay meiotic resumption and decrease the percentage of zygotes that develop morulae and their further structures.

Further research should be conducted on hormone-, serum-, and growth factor-based interventions and their potential combinations, as they have shown relatively greater efficacy. In certain instances, studies may be necessary to determine the exact mechanisms that lead to an elevated response, such as in the case of melatonin and certain growth factors. It is important to further investigate the limitations of reducing BSA concentrations in maturation and culture media, as well as the use of synthetic substances with more defined compositions. Future research should concentrate on quantitatively summarizing the effects of various treatments through meta-analysis to determine the optimal culture conditions and substance concentration and doses for oocyte maturation and embryo culture.

Besides, it is recommended to analyze the minimum serum concentration required or the conditions for serum substitution without compromising maturation and embryo development rates. When interventions have both positive and negative effects, it is important to identify the concentrations, combinations, and conditions (including intrinsic and extrinsic factors) that promote a positive response. Although the productive demand for Bovine embryos has encouraged the use of *in vitro* embryo production, as well as the exploration of different culture conditions through various interventions, some research is insufficient or presents contrasting results, preventing the generation of solid conclusions. Therefore, future research should prioritize based on the most effective interventions to generate a larger and solid body of evidence on their potential impact and practical application.

Limitations of the study

Our study has several limitations. Firstly, we did not include gray literature, which may have caused selection bias in the published evidence. Secondly, our search for published studies was limited to seven databases. Third, we limited our mapping to studies in 4 treatment categories and 19 subcategories due to the disparate methods and approaches reported in the literature. This may oversimplify the diversity of treatments and approaches used to experimentally explore Bovine *in vitro* embryo production. Fourth, to provide a summary of evidence, we included only 4 treatment



subcategories, which may introduce bias in the results produced by these groups. Fifth, the scoping review approach prevented an overall estimation of the effect and assessment of the methodological quality of these studies, despite the positive effects found on oocyte maturation and embryo development.

Conclusions

In our scoping review, the inclusion of the 231 selected studies allowed us to map body of evidence and thus assess the extent and nature of scientific publications reporting the use of various treatments during *in vitro* Bovine embryo production. In addition, our summary of the evidence on the effects of hormones, growth factors, sera, and reproductive fluids during oocyte maturation and embryo culture allowed us to synthesize and disseminate the main characteristics and findings of these studies. The evidence presented in our study demonstrates a growing interest in the study of medium composition, since the medium provides the ideal conditions to ensure nutritional and energetic support during oocyte maturation *in vitro*.

On the one hand, we found a wide variety of treatments used during the oocyte maturation process, among which studies reporting the use of hormones (E₂, GH, FSH, and LH) and growth factors (FGF, EGF, and IGF-1) showed positive effects. In addition, the reduction of FBS from 10% to 3.5% in the maturation medium was sufficient for oocyte maturation. On the other hand, during embryo culture, the response to growth factors such as EGF, IGF-1, and BMP15 is reflected in greater quantity and quality of embryos. Similarly, under some conditions, FBS and ECS improved the yield and quality of embryos produced *in vitro*. The information presented here may be useful in identifying hot topics for future investigation, especially for research topics that are inconclusive or have conflicting results. Our categorization of the body of evidence highlights the need for further investigation of those treatments that have shown the best performance in terms of oocyte maturation and embryo culture. In addition, meta-analyses are warranted to quantitatively assess the pooled effect of some of these treatments to enable evidence-based decision making.



Data availability

The original datasets used in this research and if applicable, supporting information files, are deposited and available for download at the SciELO Dataverse repository.

Acknowledgments

Carlos Lizarraga is a Ph.D. student from doctorado in Ciencias Agropecuarias from the Facultad de Medicina Veterinaria y Zootecnia of the Universidad Autónoma de Sinaloa. The leading author performed this study as a partial fulfillment of the requirements for obtaining his Ph.D. degree. The author acknowledges CONAHCYT for the postgraduate scholarship received to accomplish his studies.

Funding statement

The present study did not receive funding from any agency.

Conflicts of interest

The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest with respect to this study.

Authors contributions

We used the CRediT taxonomy to describe the contribution of each author. Conceptualization, research, and methodology: CL, PEHC, AVR, DD. Data Curation, software and visualization: CL, PEHC, AVR, DD. Project management and supervision: DD. Original writing-Drafting: CL, DD. Writing-revision, and editing: all other authors.

References

- Galli C, Duchi R, Crotti G, Turini P, Ponderato N, Colleoni S, et al. Bovine embryo technologies. Theriogenology. 2003;59(2):599–616. doi:10.1016/ s0093-691x(02)01243-8.
- Galli C, Lazzari G. Practical aspects of IVM/IVF in cattle. Animal reproduction science. 1996;42(1–4):371–379.
- Ferré L, Kjelland M, Strøbech L, Hyttel P, Mermillod P, Ross P. Recent advances in Bovine *in vitro* embryo production: reproductive biotechnology history and methods. Animal. 2020;14(5):991–1004. doi:10.1017/ S1751731119002775.
- 4. Wooldridge LK, Keane JA, Rhoads ML, Ealy AD. Bioactive supplements influencing Bovine *in vitro* embryo development. Journal of Animal Science. 2022;100(7):skac091. doi: 10.1093/jas/skac091.
- Nikoloff N, Pascua AM, Anchordoquy JM, Anchordoquy JP, Sirini MA, Seoane A, Furnus CC. Effect of eicosapentaenoic acid on Bovine cumulus–oocyte complex *in vitro*. Cell Biology International. 2017;41(5):505–513. doi: 10.1002/ cbin.10746.
- Crosier AE, Farin PW, Dykstra MJ, Alexander JE, Farin CE. Ultrastructural morphometry of Bovine blastocysts produced *in vivo* or *in vitro*. Biology of Reproduction. 2001;64(5):1375–1385. doi:10.1095/biolreprod64.5.1375.
- Hansen P. Realizing the promise of IVF in cattle-an overview. Theriogenology. 2006;65(1):119–125. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2005.09.019.

Systematic review & meta-analyses of the constraints of the constraint

- Perkel KJ, Tscherner A, Merrill C, Lamarre J, Madan P. The ART of selecting the best embryo: a review of early embryonic mortality and Bovine embryo viability assessment methods. Molecular reproduction and development. 2015;82(11):822–838. doi: 10.1002/mrd.22525.
- 9. Bó G, Mapletoft R. Evaluation and classification of Bovine embryos. Animal Reproduction. 2018;10(3):344–348.
- Charpigny G, Marquant-Le Guienne B, Richard C, Adenot P, Dubois O, Gelin V, et al. PGE2 supplementation of oocyte culture media improves the developmental and cryotolerance performance of Bovine blastocysts derived from a serum-free *in vitro* production system, mirroring the inner cell mass transcriptome. Frontiers in Cell and Developmental Biology. 2021;9:20. doi: 10.3389/ fcell.2021.672948.
- Kowalczyk-Zieba I, Boruszewska D, Suwik K, Staszkiewicz-Chodor J, Jaworska J, Woclawek-Potocka I. Iloprost affects *in vitro* maturation and developmental competence of Bovine oocytes. Theriogenology. 2020;157:286–296. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2020.07.035.
- Canon-Beltran K, Cajas YN, Perez-Cerezales S, Leal CLV, Agirregoitia E, Gutierrez-Adan A, et al. Nobiletin enhances the development and quality of Bovine embryos *in vitro* during two key periods of embryonic genome activation. Scientific Reports. 2021;11(1):18. doi: 10.1038/s41598-021-91158-7.
- Sirard M-A, Richard F, Blondin P, Robert C. Contribution of the oocyte to embryo quality. Theriogenology. 2006;65(1):126–136. doi:10.1016/j. theriogenology.2005.09.020.
- Arksey H, O'Malley L. Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. International journal of social research methodology. 2005;8(1):19–32. doi: 10.1080/1364557032000119616.
- Diaz D, Lopez-Orrantia AM, Camacho AN, Rosiles RJ, Rodriguez-Gaxiola MA, Romo-Rubio JA, et al. A scoping review and systematic map of primary studies assessing heat stress on reproductive, physiological, and productive parameters of farm animals. Veterinaria México OA. 2022;9. doi:10.22201/ fmvz.24486760e.2022.1121.
- Rubio-Rocha YG, Gaxiola SM, Chávez C, Ceballos G, Bojorquez C, Diaz D. Jaguar (*Panthera onca*) food resource use and its interaction with humans: scoping review. Veterinaria México OA. 2023;10. doi:10.22201/ fmvz.24486760e.2023.1107.
- 17. Colquhoun HL, Levac D, O'Brien KK, Straus S, Tricco AC, Perrier L, et al. Scoping reviews: time for clarity in definition, methods, and reporting. Journal of clinical epidemiology. 2014;67(12):1291–1294. doi: 10.1016/j.jclinepi.2014.03.013.
- Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): checklist and explanation. Annals of Internal Medicine. 2018;169(7):467–473. doi: 10.7326/m18-0850.
- Moher D, Shamseer L, Clarke M, Ghersi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015 statement. Systematic reviews. 2015;4(1):1. doi:0.1186/2046-4053-4-1.
- Van Driel ML, De Sutter A, De Maeseneer J, Christiaens T. Searching for unpublished trials in Cochrane reviews may not be worth the effort. Journal of clinical epidemiology. 2009;62(8):838–844. e833. doi:10.1016/j.jclinepi.2008.09.010.

Scoping review of bovine in vitro embryo production

Systematic review & meta-analyses doi: 10.22201/fmvz.24486760e.2024.1315

- 21. Viana J. 2019 Statistics of embryo production and transfer in domestic farm animals. Diverging trends for IVD and IVP embryos. Embryo Technology Newsletter. 2020:17.
- 22. Han KW, Chun JL, Lee JH, Kim KJ, Lee KB, Gotoh T, et al. Co-culture with amniotic membrane stem cells for oocyte maturation and early embryonic eevelopment in Bovine. Journal of the Faculty of Agriculture Kyushu University. 2015;60(2):393–398. doi: 10.5109/1526400.
- 23. Imai K, Matoba S, Dochi O, Shimohira I. Different factors affect developmental competence and cryotolerance in *in vitro* produced Bovine embryo. J Vet Med Sci. 2002;64(10):887–891. doi: 10.1292/jvms.64.887.
- 24. Cordova A, Perreau C, Uzbekova S, Ponsart C, Locatelli Y, Mermillod P. Development rate and gene expression of IVP Bovine embryos cocultured with Bovine oviduct epithelial cells at early or late stage of preimplantation development. Theriogenology. 2014;81(9):1163–1173. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2014.01.012.
- 25. Opiela J, Bülbül B, Romanek J. Varied approach of using MSCs for Bovine embryo *in vitro* culture. Animal Biotechnology. 2020;31(1):1–8. doi: 10.1080/1 0495398.2018.1448224.
- 26. Pereira DM, Cardoso CJT, da Silva WAL, Souza-Cáceres MB, Santos M, Pöhland R, et al. Production of *in vitro* Bovine embryos supplemented with L-carnitine in different oxygen tensions and the relation to nitric oxide. Zygote. 2020;28(5):403–408. doi: 10.1017/S0967199420000258.
- Correa GA, Rumpf R, Mundim TCD, Franco MM, Dode MAN. Oxygen tension during *in vitro* culture of Bovine embryos: effect in production and expression of genes related to oxidative stress. Animal Reproduction Science. 2008;104(2–4):132–142. doi: 10.1016/j.anireprosci.2007.02.002.
- 28. Matta S, Caldas-Bussiere M, Viana K, Faes M, de Carvalho CP, Dias B, Quirino C. Effect of inhibition of synthesis of inducible nitric oxide synthase-derived nitric oxide by aminoguanidine on the *in vitro* maturation of oocyte–cumulus complexes of cattle. Animal Reproduction Science. 2009;111(2–4):189–201. doi: 10.1016/j.anireprosci.2008.03.002.
- 29. Gopichandran N, Leese HJ. The effect of paracrine/autocrine interactions on the *in vitro* culture of Bovine preimplantation embryos. Reproduction. 2006;131(2):269–277. doi: 10.1530/rep.1.00677.
- Azari-Dolatabad N, Raes A, Pavani KC, Asaadi A, Angel-Velez D, van Damme P, et al. Follicular fluid during individual oocyte maturation enhances cumulus expansion and improves embryo development and quality in a dose-specific manner. Theriogenology. 2021;166:38–45. doi:10.1016/j. theriogenology.2021.02.016.
- Ahumada CJ, Salvador I, Cebrian-Serrano A, Lopera R, Silvestre MA. Effect of supplementation of different growth factors in embryo culture medium with a small number of Bovine embryos on *in vitro* embryo development and quality. Animal. 2013;7(3):455–462. doi: 10.1017/S1751731112001991.
- 32. Cebrian-Serrano A, Salvador I, Silvestre MA. Beneficial effect of two culture systems with small groups of embryos on the development and quality of *in vitro*-produced Bovine embryos. Anat Histol Embryol. 2014;43(1):22–30. doi:10.1111/ahe.12043.
- Sirard MA. Factors affecting oocyte and embryo transcriptomes. Reproduction in Domestic Animals. 2012;47:148–155. doi: 10.1111/j.1439-0531.2012.02069.x.



- Mucci N, Aller J, Kaiser GG, Hozbor F, Cabodevila J, Alberio RH. Effect of estrous cow serum during Bovine embryo culture on blastocyst development and cryotolerance after slow freezing or vitrification. Theriogenology. 2006;65(8):1551–1562. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2005.08.020.
- 35. Restrepo G, Chavarría N, Vásquez NA. Efecto de la suplementación con suero fetal bovino para la maduración *in vitro* de oocitos bovinos sobre su actividad mitocondrial y desarrollo embrionario. Revista CES Medicina Veterinaria y Zootecnia. 2007;2(2):14–22.
- Hamdi M, Lopera-Vasquez R, Maillo V, Sanchez-Calabuig MJ, Nunez C, Gutierrez-Adan A, Rizos D. Bovine oviductal and uterine fluid support *in vitro* embryo development. Reproduction Fertility and Development. 2018;30(7):935–945. doi: 10.1071/RD17286.
- Gandhi AP, Lane M, Gardner DK, Krisher RL. A single medium supports development of Bovine embryos throughout maturation, fertilization and culture. Hum Reprod. 2000;15(2):395–401. doi: 10.1093/humrep/15.2.395.
- Cevik M, Kocygit A, Sen U, Kuran M. Can sequential human embryo culture media be used in Bovine *in vitro* embryo culture? Kafkas Universitesi Veteriner Fakultesi Dergisi. 2014;20(1):149–153. doi: 10.9775/kvfd.2013.9676.
- Duque P, Gómez E, Diaz E, Facal N, Hidalgo C, Diez C. Use of two replacements of serum during Bovine embryo culture *in vitro*. Theriogenology. 2003;59(3–4):889–899. doi:10.1016/s0093-691x(02)01134-2.
- 40. George F, Daniaux C, Genicot G, Verhaeghe B, Lambert P, Donnay I. Set up of a serum-free culture system for Bovine embryos: embryo development and quality before and after transient transfer. Theriogenology. 2008;69(5):612–623. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2007.11.008.
- Palasz AT, Beltran Brena P, De la Fuente J, Gutierrez-Adan A. The effect of Bovine embryo culture without proteins supplements until day 4 on transcription level of hyaluronan synthases, receptors and mtDNA content. Zygote. 2010;18(2):121–129. doi: 10.1017/S0967199409990128.
- 42. Maurer H. Towards serum-free, chemically defined media for mammalian cell culture. Animal cell culture: a practical approach. 1992.
- 43. Sung LY, Du F, Xu J, Chang W, Nedambale TL, Zhang J, et al. The differential requirement of albumin and sodium citrate on the development of *in vitro* produced Bovine embryos. Reprod Nutr Dev. 2004;44(6):551–564. doi: 10.1051/rnd:2004061.
- Moreno D, Neira A, Dubreil L, Liegeois L, Destrumelle S, Michaud S, et al. *In vitro* Bovine embryo production in a synthetic medium: embryo development, cryosurvival, and establishment of pregnancy. Theriogenology. 2015;84(7):1053–1060. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2015.04.014.
- 45. Del Collado M, Saraiva NZ, Lopes FL, Cruz MH, Gaspar RC, Oliveira CS, et al. Efeitos da redução ou substituição do soro fetal bovino por outros compostos na maturação *in vitro* de oócitos bovinos. Pesquisa Veterinária Brasileira. 2014;34(7):689–694. doi: 10.1590/s0100-736x2014000700014.
- Lim KT, Jang G, Ko KH, Lee WW, Park HJ, Kim JJ, et al. Improved *in vitro* Bovine embryo development and increased efficiency in producing viable calves using defined media. Theriogenology. 2007;67(2):293–302. doi:10.1016/j. theriogenology.2006.07.011.



- 47. Sagirkaya H, Yagmur M, Nur Z, Soylu MK. Replacement of fetal calf serum with synthetic serum substitute in the *in vitro* maturation medium: effects on maturation, fertilization and subsequent development of cattle oocytes *in vitro*. Turkish Journal of Veterinary & Animal Sciences. 2004;28(4):779–784.
- 48. Sagirkaya H, Misirlioglu M, Kaya A, First NL, Parrish JJ, Memili E. Developmental potential of Bovine oocytes cultured in different maturation and culture conditions. Anim Reprod Sci. 2007;101(3–4):225–240. doi:10.1016/j.anireprosci.2006.09.016.
- Marei WF, Ghafari F, Fouladi-Nashta AA. Role of hyaluronic acid in maturation and further early embryo development of Bovine oocytes. Theriogenology. 2012;78(3):670–677. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2012.03.013.
- 50. Opiela J, Latasiewicz E, Smorag Z. Optimal concentration of hyaluronan and plant protein in different culture systems for *in vitro* maturation of Bovine oo-cytes. Indian J Exp Biol. 2012;50(12):839–846. PMID: 23986966.
- Palasz AT, Brena PB, Martinez MF, Perez-Garnelo SS, Ramirez MA, Gutierrez-Adan A, de la Fuente J. Development, molecular composition and freeze tolerance of Bovine embryos cultured in TCM-199 supplemented with hyaluronan. Zygote. 2008;16(1):39–47. doi: 10.1017/S0967199407004467.
- 52. Stojkovic M, Kolle S, Peinl S, Stojkovic P, Zakhartchenko V, Thompson JG, et al. Effects of high concentrations of hyaluronan in culture medium on development and survival rates of fresh and frozen-thawed Bovine embryos produced *in vitro*. Reproduction. 2002;124(1):141–153. doi: 10.1530/rep.0.1240141.
- 53. Rodrigues SAD, Pontelo TP, Kussano NR, Kawamoto TS, Leme LO, Caixeta FMC, et al. Effects of prostaglandins E2 and F2alpha on the *in vitro* maturation of Bovine oocytes. Domestic Animal Endocrinology. 2020;72:106447. doi: 10.1016/j.domaniend.2020.106447.
- Marques TC, da Silva Santos EC, Diesel TO, Martins CF, Cumpa HCB, de Oliveira Leme L, et al. Blastocoel fluid removal and melatonin supplementation in the culture medium improve the viability of vitrified Bovine embryos. Theriogenology. 2021;160:134–141. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2020.10.028.
- 55. Marques T, da Silva Santos E, Diesel T, Leme L, Martins C, Dode M, et al. Melatonin reduces apoptotic cells, SOD 2 and HSPB 1 and improves the *in vitro* production and quality of Bovine blastocysts. Reproduction in Domestic Animals. 2018;53(1):226–236. doi:10.1111/rda.13097.
- Diogenes MN, Guimaraes AL, Leme LO, Dode MA. Bovine *in vitro* embryo production: the effects of fibroblast growth factor 10 (FGF10). Journal of Assisted Reproduction and Genetics. 2017;34(3):383–390. doi:10.1007/ s10815-016-0852-8.
- 57. Carrillo-Gonzalez DF, Maldonado-Estrada JG. L-carnitine supplementation in culture media improves the pregnancy rate of *in vitro* produced embryos with sexed semen from *Bos taurus indicus* cows. Tropical Animal Health and Production. 2020;52(5):2559–2565. doi: 10.1007/s11250-020-02281-y.
- Ali A, Sirard MA. Protein kinases influence Bovine oocyte competence during short-term treatment with recombinant human follicle stimulating hormone. Reproduction. 2005;130(3):303–310. doi: 10.1530/rep.1.00387.
- 59. Choi YH, Carnevale EM, Seidel GE Jr., Squire EL. Effects of gonadotropins on Bovine oocytes matured in TCM-199. Theriogenology. 2001;56(4):661–670. doi: 10.1016/s0093-691x(01)00597-0.

Systematic review & meta-analyses of the constraints of the constraint

- Liu S, Feng HL, Marchesi D, Chen ZJ, Hershlag A. Dose-dependent effects of gonadotropin on oocyte developmental competence and apoptosis. Reproduction Fertility and Development. 2011;23(8):990–996. doi: 10.1071/ RD11079.
- 61. Salgado R, Vergara G Ó, Ramírez P L. Efecto de gonadotropinas sobre la maduración y desarrollo embrionario de oocitos bovinos cultivados *in vitro*. Revista MVZ Córdoba. 2010;15(1):1954–1960. doi: 10.21897/rmvz.333.
- 62. Kaya A, Sairkaya H, Misirliolu M, Gümen A, Parrish JJ, Memili E. Leptin and IGF-I improve Bovine embryo quality *in vitro*. Animal Reproduction. 2017;14(4):1151–1160. doi: 10.21451/1984-3143-ar987.
- 63. Boelhauve M, Sinowatz F, Wolf E, Paula-Lopes FF. Maturation of Bovine oocytes in the presence of leptin improves development and reduces apoptosis of *in vitro*-produced blastocysts. Biology of Reproduction. 2005;73(4):737–744. doi: 10.1095/biolreprod.105.041103.
- 64. Jia Z, Zhang J, Wu Z, Tian J. Leptin enhances maturation and development of calf oocytes *in vitro*. Reproduction in Domestic Animals. 2012;47(5):718–723. doi: 10.1111/j.1439-0531.2011.01949.x.
- Arias-Alvarez M, Bermejo-Alvarez P, Gutierrez-Adan A, Rizos D, Lorenzo PL, Lonergan P. Effect of leptin supplementation during *in vitro* oocyte maturation and embryo culture on Bovine embryo development and gene expression patterns. Theriogenology. 2011;75(5):887–896. doi:10.1016/j. theriogenology.2010.10.031.
- da Costa NN, Brito KN, Santana P, Cordeiro Mda S, Silva TV, Santos AX, et al. Effect of cortisol on Bovine oocyte maturation and embryo development *in vitro*. Theriogenology. 2016;85(2):323–329. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology. 2015.08.010.
- Banliat C, Dubuisson F, Corbin E, Beurois J, Tomas D, Le Bourhis D, et al. Intraoviductal concentrations of steroid hormones during *in vitro* culture changed phospholipid profiles and cryotolerance of Bovine embryos. Molecular Reproduction and Development. 2019;86(6):661–672. doi: 10.1002/mrd. 23144.
- Costa NN, Cordeiro MS, Silva TV, Sastre D, Santana PP, Sa AL, et al. Effect of triiodothyronine on developmental competence of Bovine oocytes. Theriogenology. 2013;80(4):295–301. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2013.04.011.
- 69. Ashkar FA, Semple E, Schmidt CH, St John E, Bartlewski PM, King WA. Thyroid hormone supplementation improves Bovine embryo development *in vitro*. Human Reproduction. 2010;25(2):334–344. doi: 10.1093/humrep/dep394.
- Dong YJ, Varisanga MD, Mtango NR, Aono M, Otoi T, Suzuki T. Improvement of the culture conditions for *in vitro* production of cattle embryos in a portable CO₂ incubator. Reproduction in Domestic Animals. 2001;36(6):313–318. doi: 10.1046/j.1439-0531.2001.00308.x.
- Moreira F, Paula-Lopes FF, Hansen PJ, Badinga L, Thatcher WW. Effects of growth hormone and insulin-like growth factor-I on development of *in vitro* derived Bovine embryos. Theriogenology. 2002;57(2):895–907. doi: 10.1016/s0093-691x(01)00694-x.
- 72. Iwata H, Ohota M, Hashimoto S, Kimura K, Isaji M, Miyake M. Stage-specific effect of growth hormone on developmental competence of Bovine em-

bryos produced *in vitro*. Journal of Reproduction and Development. 2003;49(6):493–499. doi: 10.1262/jrd.49.493.

- Dovolou E, Messinis IE, Periquesta E, Dafopoulos K, Gutierrez-Adan A, Amiridis GS. Ghrelin accelerates *in vitro* maturation of Bovine oocytes. Reproduction in Domestic Animals. 2014;49(4):665–672. doi: 10.1111/rda.12344.
- 74. Dovolou E, Periquesta E, Messinis IE, Tsiligianni T, Dafopoulos K, Gutierrez-Adan A, Amiridis GS. Daily supplementation with ghrelin improves *in vitro* Bovine blastocysts formation rate and alters gene expression related to embryo quality. Theriogenology. 2014;81(4):565–571. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2013.11.009.
- 75. Dashtizad M, Haron AW, Yusoff R, Daliri M, Hajarian H, Najari M, et al. Synergistic effect of insulin on *in vitro* development of immature Bovine oocytes. American Journal of Animal and Veterinary Sciences. 2010;5(4):258–265. doi: 10.3844/ajavsp.2010.258.265.
- Beker AR, Colenbrander B, Bevers MM. Effect of 17beta-estradiol on the *in vi*tro maturation of Bovine oocytes. Theriogenology. 2002;58(9):1663–1673. doi: 10.1016/s0093-691x(02)01082-8.
- Larson JE, Krisher RL, Lamb GC. Effects of supplemental progesterone on the development, metabolism and blastocyst cell number of Bovine embryos produced *in vitro*. Reproduction Fertility and Development. 2011;23(2):311–318. doi: 10.1071/RD10106.
- 78. Matsuo M, Sumitomo K, Ogino C, Gunji Y, Nishimura R, Hishinuma M. Threestep *in vitro* maturation culture of Bovine oocytes imitating temporal changes of estradiol-17<i>β</i> and progesterone concentrations in preovulatory follicular fluid. Archives Animal Breeding. 2017;60(4):385–390. doi: 10.5194/aab-60-385-2017.
- Reis AN, Silva LKX, Silva AOA, Sousa JS, Vale WG. Effect of estradiol and progesterone on development and quality of Bovine embryos produced *in vitro*. Arquivo Brasileiro de Medicina Veterinária e Zootecnia. 2010;62(6):1375–1380. doi: 10.1590/s0102-09352010000600012.
- Silva CC, Knight PG. Effects of androgens, progesterone and their antagonists on the developmental competence of *in vitro* matured Bovine oocytes. Journal of Reproduction and Fertility. 2000;119(2):261–269. PMID: 10864838
- Soares ACS, Lodde V, Barros RG, Price CA, Luciano AM, Buratini J. Steroid hormones interact with natriuretic peptide C to delay nuclear maturation, to maintain oocyte-cumulus communication and to improve the quality of *in vitro*-produced embryos in cattle. Reproduction Fertility and Development. 2017;29(11):2217–2224. doi: 10.1071/RD16320.
- Marques TC, Santos E, Diesel TO, Martins CF, Cumpa HCB, Leme LO, et al. Blastocoel fluid removal and melatonin supplementation in the culture medium improve the viability of vitrified Bovine embryos. Theriogenology. 2021;160:134–141. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2020.10.028.
- Zhao XM, Wang N, Hao HS, Li CY, Zhao YH, Yan CL, et al. Melatonin improves the fertilization capacity and developmental ability of Bovine oocytes by regulating cytoplasmic maturation events. J Pineal Res. 2018;64(1):15. doi: 10.1111/jpi.12445.
- 84. Wang F, Tian X, Zhou Y, Tan D, Zhu S, Dai Y, Liu G. Melatonin improves the quality of *in vitro* produced (IVP) Bovine embryos: implications for blastocyst



development, cryotolerance, and modifications of relevant gene expression. PloS one. 2014;9(4):e93641. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0093641.

- 85. Yang M, Tao J, Chai M, Wu H, Wang J, Li G, et al. Melatonin improves the quality of inferior Bovine oocytes and promoted their subsequent IVF embryo development: mechanisms and results. Molecules. 2017;22(12):15. doi: 10.3390/molecules22122059.
- Marques TC, da Silva Santos EC, Diesel TO, Leme LO, Martins CF, Dode M, et al. Melatonin reduces apoptotic cells, SOD2 and HSPB1 and improves the *in vitro* production and quality of Bovine blastocysts. Reproduction in Domestic Animals. 2018;53(1):226–236. doi: 10.1111/rda.13097.
- Pang Y, Zhao S, Sun Y, Jiang X, Hao H, Du W, Zhu H. Protective effects of melatonin on the *in vitro* developmental competence of Bovine oocytes. Animal Science Journal. 2018;89(4):648–660. doi: 10.1111/asj.12970.
- Tian X, Wang F, He C, Zhang L, Tan D, Reiter RJ, et al. Beneficial effects of melatonin on Bovine oocytes maturation: a mechanistic approach. Journal of Pineal Research. 2014;57(3):239–247. doi: 10.1111/jpi.12163.
- Gutierrez-Anez JC, Lucas-Hahn A, Hadeler KG, Aldag P, Niemann H. Melatonin enhances *in vitro* developmental competence of cumulus-oocyte complexes collected by ovum pick-up in prepubertal and adult dairy cattle. Theriogenology. 2021;161:285–293. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2020.12.011.
- Algarra B, Maillo V, Aviles M, Gutierrez-Adan A, Rizos D, Jimenez-Movilla M. Effects of recombinant OVGP1 protein on *in vitro* Bovine embryo development. Journal of Reproduction and Development. 2018;64(5):433–443. doi:10.1262/jrd.2018-058.
- Yoshioka K, Suzuki C, Iwamura S. Effects of activin A and follistatin on developmental kinetics of Bovine embryos: cinematographic analysis in a chemically defined medium. Journal of Reproduction and Fertility. 2000;118(1):119–125. doi: 10.1530/reprod/118.1.119.
- 92. Sakagami N, Umeki H, Nishino O, Uchiyama H, Ichikawa K, Takeshita K, et al. Normal calves produced after transfer of embryos cultured in a chemically defined medium supplemented with epidermal growth factor and insulin-like growth factor I following ovum pick up and *in vitro* fertilization in Japanese black cows. J Reprod Dev. 2012;58(1):140–146. doi: 10.1262/jrd.11-050m.
- Sirisathien S, Brackett BG. TUNEL analyses of Bovine blastocysts after culture with EGF and IGF-I. Mol Reprod Dev. 2003;65(1):51–56. doi: 10.1002/ mrd.10263.
- Sirisathien S, Hernandez-Fonseca HJ, Brackett BG. Influences of epidermal growth factor and insulin-like growth factor-I on Bovine blastocyst development *in vitro*. Anim Reprod Sci. 2003;77(1–2):21–32. doi:10.1016/ s0378-4320(02)00272-5.
- 95. Mesalam A, Lee KL, Khan I, Chowdhury MMR, Zhang S, Song SH, et al. A combination of Bovine serum albumin with insulin-transferrin-sodium selenite and/or epidermal growth factor as alternatives to fetal Bovine serum in culture medium improves Bovine embryo quality and trophoblast invasion by induction of matrix metalloproteinases. Reprod Fertil Dev. 2019;31(2):333–346. doi: 10.1071/RD18162.
- 96. Mtango NR, Varisanga MD, Dong YJ, Rajamahendran R, Suzuki T. Growth factors and growth hormone enhance *in vitro* embryo production and post-thaw surviv-

al of vitrified Bovine blastocysts. Theriogenology. 2003;59(5–6):1393–1402. doi: 10.1016/s0093-691x(02)01163-9.

- Polat B, Salmanoglu MR. The influence of epidermal growth factor on maturation and fertilisation of Bovine oocytes *in vitro*. Turkish Journal of Veterinary & Animal Sciences. 2008;32(6):457–462.
- 98. Wang Z, Fu C, Yu S. Effects of green tea polyphenols, insulin-like growth factor I and glucose on developmental competence of Bovine oocytes. Revista Brasileira de Zootecnia. 2012;41(12):2418–2423. doi:10.1590/s1516-35982012001200006.
- Neira JA, Tainturier D, Pena MA, Martal J. Effect of the association of IGF-I, IGF-II, bFGF, TGF-beta1, GM-CSF, and LIF on the development of Bovine embryos produced *in vitro*. Theriogenology. 2010;73(5):595–604. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2009.10.015.
- 100. Kocygit A, Cevik M, Sen U, Kuran M. The effect of macromolecule and growth factor combinations on *in vitro*development of Bovine embryos. Turkish Journal of Veterinary and Animal Sciences. 2015;39(3):308–313. doi: 10.3906/vet-1411–1445.
- 101. Hernandez-Fonseca HJ, Sirisathien S, Bosch P, Cho HS, Lott JD, Hawkins LL, et al. Offspring resulting from direct transfer of cryopreserved Bovine embryos produced *in vitro* in chemically defined media. Animal Reproduction Science. 2002;69(3–4):151–158. doi: 10.1016/s0378-4320(01)00178-6.
- 102. Velazquez MA, Hermann D, Kues WA, Niemann H. Increased apoptosis in Bovine blastocysts exposed to high levels of IGF1 is not associated with downregulation of the IGF1 receptor. Reproduction. 2011;141(1):91–103. doi: 10.1530/REP-10-0336.
- 103. Dhali A, Anchamparuthy VM, Butler SP, Pearson RE, Gwazdauskas FC. In vitro development of Bovine embryos cultured with stem cell factor or insulin-like growth factor-I following IVF with semen of two bulls having different field fertility. Anim Reprod Sci. 2009;116(3–4):188–195. doi: 10.1016/j.anireprosci.2009.02.007.
- 104. Zhang K, Ealy AD. Supplementing fibroblast growth factor 2 during Bovine oocyte <i>*in vitro*</i> maturation promotes subsequent embryonic development. Open Journal of Animal Sciences. 2012;02(02):119–126. doi: 10.4236/ojas.2012.22017.
- 105. Fields SD, Hansen PJ, Ealy AD. Fibroblast growth factor requirements for *in vitro* development of Bovine embryos. Theriogenology. 2011;75(8):1466–1475. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2010.12.007.
- 106. Diogenes MN, Guimaraes ALS, Leme LO, Mauricio MF, Dode MAN. Effect of prematuration and maturation with fibroblast growth factor 10 (FGF10) on *in vitro* development of Bovine oocytes. Theriogenology. 2017;102:190–198. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2017.06.004.
- 107. Machado MF, Caixeta ES, Sudiman J, Gilchrist RB, Thompson JG, Lima PF, et al. Fibroblast growth factor 17 and bone morphogenetic protein 15 enhance cumulus expansion and improve quality of *in vitro*-produced embryos in cattle. Theriogenology. 2015;84(3):390–398. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2015.03.031.
- 108. Sudiman J, Sutton-McDowall ML, Ritter LJ, White MA, Mottershead DG, Thompson JG, Gilchrist RB. Bone morphogenetic protein 15 in the pro-mature complex form enhances Bovine oocyte developmental competence. PloS One. 2014;9(7):e103563. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0103563.



- 109. Sugimura S, Ritter LJ, Sutton-McDowall ML, Mottershead DG, Thompson JG, Gilchrist RB. Amphiregulin co-operates with bone morphogenetic protein 15 to increase Bovine oocyte developmental competence: effects on gap junction-mediated metabolite supply. Mol Hum Reprod. 2014;20(6):499–513. doi: 10.1093/molehr/gau013.
- 110. Conde P, Morado S, Alvarez G, Smitz J, Gentile T, Cetica P. Effect of the hematopoietic growth factors erythropoietin and kit ligand on Bovine oocyte *in vitro* maturation and developmental competence. Theriogenology. 2019;123:37–44. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2018.09.014.
- 111. Garcia-Hernandez J, Castro-Valenzuela BE, Rodriguez-Borbon A, Grado-Ahuir JA, Burrola-Barraza ME. IMD/ADM21-47, a factor that improves embryo quality. Theriogenology. 2020;146:1–13. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2020.01.049.
- 112. Salgado R, Barrera J, Correa S, Estrada L. Efecto de tres diferentes fracciones de peso molecular alto del medio condicionado por células BRL en el desarrollo embrionario bovino *in vitro*. Revista MVZ Córdoba. 2001;6(2):111–118.
- 113. Seekford ZK, Wooldridge LK, Dias NW, Timlin CL, Sales AF, Speckhart SL, et al. Interleukin-6 supplementation improves post-transfer embryonic and fetal development of *in vitro*-produced Bovine embryos. Theriogenology. 2021;170:15–22. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2021.04.004.
- 114. Vejlsted M, Avery B, Gjorret JO, Maddox-Hyttel P. Effect of leukemia inhibitory factor (LIF) on *in vitro* produced Bovine embryos and their outgrowth colonies. Mol Reprod Dev. 2005;70(4):445–454. doi: 10.1002/mrd.20221.
- 115. Collares LF, Pradieé J, Borges MA, Mion B, Gindri P, Fadrique J, et al. Supplementation of *in vitro* maturation medium with serum from dairy cows at early and late lactation in the *in vitro* production of Bovine embryos. Medicina Veterinária (UFRPE). 2018;12(4):311–315. doi: 10.26605/medvet-v12n4-2462.
- 116. Pereira MM, Machado MA, Costa FQ, Serapiao RV, Viana JH, Camargo LS. Effect of oxygen tension and serum during IVM on developmental competence of Bovine oocytes. Reprod Fertil Dev. 2010;22(7):1074–1082. doi:10.1071/ RD10007.
- 117. Fernandes-Franca PH, Oliveira-Santos MV, Oliveira-Lira GP, Azevedo-Borges A, Fernandes-Pereira A. Influence of different protein supplements on the recovery and *in vitro* maturation of Bovine oocytes. Revista Colombiana de Ciencias Pecuarias. 2019;33(3):172–181. doi: 10.17533/udea.rccp.v33n3a01.
- 118. Mesalam A, Kong R, Khan I, Chowdhury M, Choi BH, Kim SW, et al. Effect of charcoal:dextran stripped fetal Bovine serum on *in vitro* development of Bovine embryos. Reprod Biol. 2017;17(4):312–319. doi:10.1016/j.repbio.2017.09.002.
- 119. Sudano MJ, Paschoal DM, Rascado Tda S, Magalhaes LC, Crocomo LF, de Lima-Neto JF, Landim-Alvarenga Fda C. Lipid content and apoptosis of *in vitro*-produced Bovine embryos as determinants of susceptibility to vitrification. Theriogenology. 2011;75(7):1211–1220. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2010.11.033.
- Leivas FG, Brum DS, Fialho SS, Saliba WP, Alvim MT, Bernardi ML, et al. Fetal calf serum enhances *in vitro* production of *Bos taurus indicus* embryos. Theriogenology. 2011;75(3):429–433. doi: 10.1016/j.theriogenology.2010.08.017.
- 121. Reis A, Rooke JA, McCallum GJ, Staines ME, Ewen M, Lomax MA, McEvoy TG. Consequences of exposure to serum, with or without vitamin E supplementation, in terms of the fatty acid content and viability of Bovine blastocysts produced *in vitro*. Reprod Fertil Dev. 2003;15(5):275–284. doi: 10.1071/rd03004.

- Murillo A, Munoz M, Martin-Gonzalez D, Carrocera S, Martinez-Nistal A, Gomez E. Low serum concentration in Bovine embryo culture enhances early blastocyst rates on day-6 with quality traits in the expanded blastocyst stage similar to BSA-cultured embryos. Reprod Biol. 2017;17(2):162–171. doi: 10.1016/j. repbio.2017.04.002.
- 123. Alm H, Torner H, Kanitz W, Roschlau K. Influence of oocyte recovery method, *in vitro* fertilization method and serum source on embryonic development of *in vitro* matured Bovine oocytes. Archiv Fur Tierzucht-Archives of Animal Breeding. 2008;51(3):224–234. doi:10.5194/aab-51-224-2008.
- 124. Caínzos J, Barrio M, Ruibal S, Becerra JJ, Quintela LA, Herradón PG. Effect of fetal calf serum (FCS), Bovine albumin serum (BSA) and polyvinyl pyrrolidone (PVP) suplementation in Bovine oocyte maturation medium *in vitro*. ITEA. 2013;109(1):25–32.
- 125. Ali A, Coenen K, Bousquet D, Sirard MA. Origin of Bovine follicular fluid and its effect during *in vitro* maturation on the developmental competence of Bovine oocytes. Theriogenology. 2004;62(9):1596–1606. doi:10.1016/j. theriogenology.2004.03.011.
- 126. Momozawa K, Fukuda Y. Effects of fractions of Bovine follicular fluid and fetal Bovine serum as supplements to maturation medium on *in vitro* development of *in vitro* fertilized Bovine embryos. Journal of Mammalian Ova Research. 2011;28(1):68–74. doi: 10.1274/jmor.28.68.
- 127. Cruz MHC, Saraiva NZ, Cruz JFd, Oliveira CS, del Collado M, Fernandes H, et al. Effect of follicular fluid supplementation during *in vitro* maturation on total cell number in Bovine blastocysts produced *in vitro*. Revista Brasileira de Zootecnia. 2014;43(3):120–126. doi: 10.1590/s1516-35982014000300003.
- 128. Lopera-Vasquez R, Hamdi M, Maillo V, Lloreda V, Coy P, Gutierrez-Adan A, et al. Effect of Bovine oviductal fluid on development and quality of Bovine embryos produced *in vitro*. Reprod Fertil Dev. 2017;29(3):621–629. doi: 10.1071/ RD15238.
- 129. Cebrian-Serrano A, Salvador I, Garcia-Rosello E, Pericuesta E, Perez-Cerezales S, Gutierrez-Adan A, et al. Effect of the Bovine oviductal fluid on *in vitro* fertilization, development and gene expression of *in vitro*-produced Bovine blastocysts. Reprod Domest Anim. 2013;48(2):331–338. doi:10.1111/j.1439-0531.2012.02157x.